

DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 166 101

SO 011 482

AUTHOR Stahl, Robert J.; And Others
TITLE Humanistic and Behavioristic Teachers on the
Precollege Level: A Second Report on the Non-Existent
Differences Between Them.
PUB DATE 22 Nov 78
NOTE 17p.; Paper presented at Annual Meeting of the
National Council for the Social Studies (Houston,
Texas, November 22, 1978)
EDRS PRICE MF-\$0.83 HC-\$1.67 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS *Comparative Analysis; Course Content; Course
Objectives; *Differences; *Psychology; Secondary
Education; Social Science Research; Tables (Data);
*Teacher Background; Teachers; *Teaching Methods

ABSTRACT

This paper reports on a study which compared the background and teaching methodology of high school psychology teachers who label their courses either "humanistic" or "behavioristic." A sample of 154 humanistic and 119 behavioristic psychology teachers in Illinois provided data about variables including extent and kinds of professional and academic training they had received; make-up of the high school psychology classes they currently taught; objectives, content, and teaching methodologies of their classes; and types of audiovisual materials they preferred. Of a total of 114 variables examined, the teachers differed on only 14 variables. These data are very similar to results of previous studies in other states. Conclusions are that secondary school psychology teachers have articulated no clear framework for distinguishing between humanistic and behavioristic principles or methods. Another conclusion might be that teachers seek labels for their courses that are most comfortable for themselves or that they believe their schools' administration would most accept. (Author/AV)

* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *

Humanistic and Behavioristic
Teachers on the Precollege Level:
A Second Report on the
Non-Existent Differences Between Them

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH,
EDUCATION & WELFARE
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF
EDUCATION

THIS DOCUMENT HAS BEEN REPRODUCED EXACTLY AS RECEIVED FROM THE PERSON OR ORGANIZATION ORIGINATING IT. POINTS OF VIEW OR OPINIONS STATED DO NOT NECESSARILY REPRESENT OFFICIAL NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION POSITION OR POLICY.

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

Robert J. Stahl

TO THE NATIONAL ARCHIVES
INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC) AND
USERS OF THE ERIC SYSTEM."

Robert J. Stahl, Assistant Professor
Department of Secondary Education
Arizona State University
Tempe, Arizona

and

James C. Matiya, Teacher of Psychology
Carl Sandburg High School
Orland Park, Illinois

and

Blanche Sherman Hunt, Graduate Associate
Department of Secondary Education
Arizona State University
Tempe, Arizona

Paper presented at the annual meeting of the National Council for the Social Studies, Houston, Texas, on November 22, 1978

Humanistic and Behavioristic Teachers on the Precollege Level:
A Second Report on the Non-Existent Differences Between Them

by

Robert J. Stahl, James C. Matiya, and Blanche Sherman Hunt

Much has been assumed about the differences which exist between courses taught by and the qualifications of Humanistic and Behavioristic teachers in the secondary school curriculum. Only recently have empirical data been available by which these assumptions could be verified or refuted (Stahl, 1977a, 1977b, 1978). In this report, a new set of data obtained from a 1977-78 questionnaire survey of Illinois high school psychology teachers was used for comparing these two groups of teachers to determine whether or not the results of previous studies hold true for other teachers in other states.

An analysis of the responses of 154 "Humanistic" and 119 "Behavioristic" Illinois psychology teachers along such diverse variables as the make-up of their classes, the objectives set for, content of, and methodologies employed in teaching their courses, the extent and kinds of professional and academic training they had received, and the types of audio-visual materials they desired revealed few differences existed between these two groups of teachers. In fact, of the 114 variables examined, these teachers differed significantly ($p < .05$) on just 14 variables. The fact that there was as many as 14 differences between these groups should be interpreted with caution. While significant chi-square differences were reported for each of these items, when they were rank ordered, many of these 14 items were

assigned identical ranks by both "Humanistic and Behavioristic" teachers.

Among the important areas where these two groups of teachers were found to be identical are:

- a) the methods they used in teaching their courses;
- b) the topics and content they included in their courses and that they thought should be included in their respective courses;
- c) the types of audio-visual aids and instructional materials they indicated they desired to see made available for their use;
- d) the current area of their teacher certification;
- e) the objectives they posited for their courses;
- f) the degree level of their college training;
- g) the average number of semester hours of college credit in psychology and educational psychology they had earned;
- h) the length of time their separate psychology courses met;
- i) the racial composition of their class enrollments;
- j) the type, size, and location of the schools in which they offered their separate courses;
- and
- k) the methods they used in teaching their courses.

In reviewing the comparative data on these two groups of teachers, the one theme which repeats itself throughout is that, for all practical considerations, there exists no real difference between Humanistic and Behavioristic psychology teachers and their respective courses on the pre-college level.

These data are nearly identical to data for Humanistic and Behavioristic teachers in Florida (1974-75) and Mississippi (1975-76) (Stahl, 1977a). A more recent and as yet unreported 1977-78 Mississippi survey study produced results which nearly duplicated these Illinois data. Consequently, sufficient evidence appears to exist to state that the pattern of similarity between these two groups as outlined above is characteristic of groups of precollege psychology teachers who claim these two labels. One clear implication can be drawn from these repeated findings. That is, like the old cliché "you can't judge a book by its cover," it seems evident that "You can't judge a course by the label its teacher selects to attach to it."

One may conclude from these repeated findings that secondary school psychology teachers have articulated no clear framework for distinguishing between "Humanistic" and "Behavioristic" principles, practices, procedures, or methods. (This same inference may well be drawn concerning the teacher educators who trained these teachers in terms of principles, practices, and methods.) A second conclusion might be that teachers "do their own thing" so to speak, and thus seek labels that they find most comfortable for themselves or that they believe their schools administration would most accept. Yet a third conclusion is possible. It may well be that these data confirm what some individuals have long contended--that in truth, and reality there's not a dime's worth of difference between "Humanism" and "Behaviorism" in practice.

In addition to these teacher data, the rankings of these two groups of teachers for such items as course objectives, course content, teaching methods, instructional material and audio-visual aids were nearly

identical ($p < .05$) with the ranking for similar items by 1,137 students enrolled in these psychology courses in Illinois. Thus, neither "Humanistic" nor "Behavioristic" teachers come closer to meeting the needs of their students as expressed by the students themselves. This finding also confirms earlier data to this effect (Stahl, 1978).

Finally, considering that only a handful of states have proposed definitive curriculum guides for their high school psychology courses and since the course's objectives, content, methods, and approaches have not been dictated, psychology courses on this level remain what the teachers assigned to these courses want them to be - regardless of the labels that they choose to use to identify their approach.

REFERENCES

- Stahl, Robert J. "Humanistic and behavioristic psychology teachers on the precollege level: Are their approaches different?" High School Behavioral Science, 1977a, 4, (2, Spring), 68-78.
- Stahl, Robert J. "Are humanistic psychology teachers on the precollege level different from their behavioristic counterparts?" The Affect Tree, 1977b, II, (1, July), 7.
- Stahl, Robert J. "Meeting the needs of precollege psychology students: Who comes closest: Humanistic or behavioristic teachers?" Paper presented at the annual meeting of the American Educational Research Association, Toronto. March 31, 1978. (ERIC Microfiche No. ED 152 742).

Table 1

A Summary of Percentages, Adjusted Chi-Square Values, and Ranks Assigned
to Course Objectives by the Humanistic and Behavioristic
Teachers and Their Students

Objectives	Humanistic Teachers		Behavioristic Teachers		Adjusted		Students	
	%	R	%	R	χ^2	P	%	R
a) Understand themselves	88.3	1.0	84.0	1.0	.715	.40	45.6	3
b) Adjusting to life	86.4	2.0	69.7	4.0	10.235	.00*	47.4	2
c) Understand personal problems	81.8	3.0	78.2	2.0	.361	.55	55.8	1
d) Understanding vocabulary	66.9	4.5	64.7	5.0	.061	.80	15.5	12
e) Philosophy of life	66.9	4.5	45.4	11.0	11.839	.00*	31.9	7
f) Cope with adolescence	64.9	6.0	54.6	10.0	2.570	.11	24.1	9
g) Appreciation for Psychology	63.6	7.0	71.4	3.0	1.509	.22	28.8	8
h) Future family life	60.4	8.0	55.5	9.0	.483	.49	40.5	4
i) Apply psychological knowledge	56.5	9.0	56.3	7.5	.008	.93	37.8	5
j) Prepare for college psychology	55.8	10.0	61.3	6.0	.624	.43	34.0	6
k) Eliminate misconceptions	51.3	11.0	56.3	7.5	.489	.48	22.5	10
l) Vocational planning	13.6	12.0	16.8	12.0	.309	.58	21.3	11

Note: Percent signs are omitted.

* $p < .05$

The rank order correlation coefficient for Humanistic and Behavioristic Teachers is .61. ($p < .02$).

The $\Sigma d^2 = 111$ ($df = 12$).

The rank order correlation coefficient for Humanistic Teachers and Students is .54. ($p < .05$).

The $\Sigma d^2 = 130.5$ ($df = 12$).

The rank order correlation coefficient for Behavioristic Teachers and Students is .52 ($p < .05$).

The $\Sigma d^2 = 135.5$ ($df = 12$).

Table 2

A Summary of Percentages, Adjusted Chi-Square Values, and Ranks Assigned
the Topics These Teachers Included and Students Thought
Should be Included in Their Respective Courses

Topics	Humanistic Teachers		Behavioristic Teachers		Adjusted		Students	
	%	R	%	R	χ^2	p	%	R
a) Personality theory	92.9	1	93.3	1.0	.011	.92	60.8	5.0
b) Emotions	88.3	2	77.3	5.5	5.129	.02 *	76.3	1.0
c) Mental illness	87.0	3	82.4	3.0	.806	.37	64.9	3.0
d) Mental health	85.1	4	75.6	8.0	3.287	.07	55.7	10.0
e) Abnormal behavior	80.5	5	77.3	5.5	.247	.62	59.8	7.0
f) Intelligence	75.3	6	79.0	4.0	.323	.57	45.5	13.0
g) Motivation	74.7	7	76.5	7.0	.040	.84	42.7	16.0
h) The adolescent	72.1	8	55.5	14.0	7.416	.007*	56.7	9.0
i) Learning and thinking	70.8	9	83.2	2.0	5.039	.02 *	50.9	11.0
j) Growth and development	70.1	10	64.7	10.0	.673	.41	45.2	14.5
k) Social behavior	66.9	11	63.9	11.0	.154	.70	65.7	2.0
l) Sensation and perception	66.2	12	66.4	9.0	.011	.92	38.7	18.0
m) Parapsychology, ESP	63.0	13	59.7	13.0	.188	.66	42.0	17.0
n) Mental retardation	57.1	14	62.2	12.0	.514	.47	50.0	12.0
o) Love	56.5	15	37.0	18.0	9.479	.002*	61.1	4.0
p) History of psychology	55.2	16	53.8	15.0	.012	.91	30.6	20.0
q) Drugs, alcoholism, etc.	52.6	17	48.7	16.0	.260	.61	60.0	6.0
r) Marriage and the family	45.5	18	33.6	20.0	3.436	.06	59.0	8.0
s) Heredity and genetics	44.8	19	40.3	17.0	.380	.54	35.0	19.0
t) Child care	34.4	20	26.1	21.0	1.829	.17	45.2	4.5
u) Human body/physiology	31.8	21	35.3	19.0	.225	.64	22.3	21.0
v) Statistics	16.9	22	25.2	22.0	2.367	.12	18.4	22.0

The rank order correlation coefficient for Humanistic and Behavioristic Teachers is .90. ($p < .005$).

The $\sum d^2 = 179.25$ ($df = 22$).

The rank order correlation coefficient for Humanistic Teachers and Students is .59. ($p < .005$).

The $\sum d^2 = 737.5$ ($df = 22$).

The rank order correlation coefficient for Behavioristic Teachers and Students is .42. ($p < .05$).

The $\sum d^2 = 1024$ ($df = 22$).

Table 3

A Summary of Percentages, Adjusted Chi-Square Values, and Ranks Assigned
 to the Topics These Teachers and Their Students Thought
 Should be Included Within These Courses

Topics	Humanistic Teachers		Behavioristic Teachers		Adjusted		Students	
	%	R	%	R	χ^2	p	%	R
a) Personality theory	89.6	1.0	89.9	1.0	.014	.91	60.8	5.0
b) Emotions	88.3	2.0	81.5	4.0	1.968	.16	76.3	1.0
c) Mental health	85.7	3.5	79.0	6.0	1.683	.19	55.7	10.0
d) The adolescent	85.7	3.5	72.3	11.5	6.730	.01*	56.7	9.0
e) Mental illness	83.8	5.0	86.6	2.0	.220	.64	64.9	3.0
f) Motivation	80.5	6.0	83.2	3.0	.167	.68	42.7	16.0
g) Social Behavior	78.6	7.0	76.5	8.5	.071	.79	65.7	2.0
h) Growth and development	77.9	8.5	76.5	8.5	.019	.89	45.2	14.5
i) Abnormal behavior	77.9	8.5	76.5	8.5	.019	.89	59.8	7.0
j) Learning and thinking	76.6	10.0	79.8	5.0	.238	.63	50.9	11.0
k) Intelligence	72.7	11.0	76.5	8.5	.317	.57	45.5	13.0
l) Sensation and perception	66.2	12.0	72.3	11.5	.876	.34	38.7	18.0
m) Love	64.3	13.0	40.3	19.0	14.544	.00*	61.1	4.0
n) Mental retardation	61.7	14.0	62.2	13.0	.002	.97	50.0	12.0
o) Drugs, alcoholism, etc.	59.7	15.0	50.4	15.5	2.000	.16	60.0	6.0
p) Marriage and the family	59.1	16.0	47.9	17.0	2.951	.09	59.0	8.0
q) Parapsychology, ESP	57.8	17.0	50.4	15.5	1.189	.28	42.0	17.0
r) History of psychology	51.9	18.0	54.6	14.0	.100	.75	30.6	20.0
s) Child care	46.8	19.0	38.7	20.0	1.478	.22	45.2	14.5
t) Heredity and genetics	44.8	20.0	43.7	18.0	.004	.95	35.0	19.0
u) Human body/physiology	37.7	21.0	35.3	21.0	.076	.78	22.3	21.0
v) Statistics	22.7	22.0	26.9	22.0	.424	.52	18.4	22.0

Note: Percent signs are omitted.

*p < .05

The rank order correlation coefficient for Humanistic and Behavioristic Teachers is .89. (p < .005).
 The $\Sigma d^2 = 187.5$ (df = 22).

The rank order correlation coefficient for Humanistic Teachers and Students is .68. (p < .005).
 The $\Sigma d^2 = 553.25$ (df = 22).

The rank order correlation coefficient for Behavioristic Teachers and Students is .51. (p < .01).
 The $\Sigma d^2 = 863$ (df = 22).

Table 4

A Summary of Frequencies, Means, Standard Deviations, and Ranks
Assigned to Teaching Methods Used by These Teachers and Their Students

Teaching Methods	Humanistic Teachers				Behavioristic Teachers				F	Students	
	N	\bar{X}	Sd	R	N	\bar{X}	Sd	R		\bar{X}	R
a) Discussion (other than review)	147	4.18	.69	1	113	4.11	.74	1	.76	3.19	1
b) Text and lecture	139	4.05	.84	2	107	3.42	1.01	2	26.20*	2.45	8
c) Lecture	136	3.52	.86	3	101	3.86	.86	3	7.84*	2.52	6
d) Teacher demonstrations	136	3.21	.84	4	100	3.08	.85	4	1.28	2.94	2
e) Small group discussions	144	3.07	.86	5	105	2.90	.99	5	1.97	2.73	4
f) Values clarification activities	134	3.05	1.01	6	98	2.68	1.05	6	7.25*	2.48	7
g) Student lab experiments	133	2.69	.96	7	103	2.63	.94	7	.09	2.80	3
h) Guest speakers	135	2.49	.84	8	101	2.27	.81	8	4.06*	2.70	5

Note: Percent signs are omitted.

* $p < .05$

The rank order correlation coefficient for Humanistic and Behavioristic Teachers is .97. ($p < .001$).

The $\Sigma d^2 = 2$ (df = 8).

The rank order correlation coefficient for Humanistic Teachers and Students is .10.

The $\Sigma d^2 = 76$ (df = 8).

The rank order correlation coefficient for Behavioristic Teachers and Students is .14.

The $\Sigma d^2 = 72$ (df = 8).

Table 5

A Summary of Percentages, Adjusted Chi-Square Values, and Ranks Assigned
the Types of Instructional Materials These Teachers and Their
Students Wanted to See Made Available to Them for Their Use

Type of Instructional Materials	Humanistic Teachers		Behavioristic Teachers		Adjusted		Students	
	%	R	%	R	χ^2	p	%	R
a) Films	67.5	1.0	72.3	1.0	.505	.48	82.1	1
b) Simulation games	64.3	2.0	62.2	3.0	.053	.82	56.6	3
c) Materials for class experiments	59.1	3.0	64.7	2.0	.673	.41	52.7	4
d) List of guest speakers	58.4	4.0	52.9	4.5	.616	.43	73.5	2
e) Sample psychological tests	53.9	5.0	52.9	4.5	.001	.97	52.2	5
f) Values clarification activities	39.6	6.0	31.9	8.0	1.395	.23	15.9	13
g) Student worksheets	35.1	7.0	37.8	7.0	.117	.73	18.9	12
h) Filmstrips	33.1	8.5	38.7	6.0	.673	.41	49.8	6
i) Overhead transparencies	32.5	8.5	30.3	10.0	.139	.70	15.7	14
j) Newsletter for teachers	32.5	10.0	30.3	10.0	.067	.80	----	--
k) Different kind of textbook	31.8	11.0	21.0	15.0	3.442	.06	19.9	11
l) Audio-cassette tapes	25.3	12.0	25.2	13.0	.014	.91	30.3	9
m) Reference service for students	24.7	13.0	24.7	14.0	.006	.94	30.4	8
n) Materials for slow learners	21.4	14.0	21.4	17.0	1.837	.18	11.8	15
o) Career-related pamphlets	20.8	15.0	20.8	10.0	2.734	.10	29.4	10
p) Posters of famous psychologists	17.5	16.0	17.5	12.0	2.424	.12	5.9	16
q) Curriculum guide	14.9	17.0	14.9	16.0	.192	.66	----	--

Note: Percent signs are omitted.

The rank order correlation coefficient for Teacher Data is .90. ($p < .005$). The $\sum d^2 = 84$ ($df = 17$).

The rank order correlation coefficient for Humanistic Teachers and Students is .74. ($p < .005$).

The $\sum d^2 = 144.5$ ($df = 15$).

The rank order correlation coefficient for Behavioristic Teachers and Students is .69. ($p < .005$).

The $\sum d^2 = 171.25$ ($df = 15$).

BIBLIOGRAPHY ON PRECOLLEGE PSYCHOLOGY

(Robert J. Stahl)

- Stahl, R. J. "Meeting the needs of precollege psychology students: Who comes closest: Humanistic or Behavioristic Teachers?" Paper presented at the annual meeting of the American Educational Research Association, Toronto. March 31, 1978. (Submitted to ERIC for microfiche files). EA 152 742
- Stahl, R. J. Humanistic and behavioristic psychology teachers on the precollege level: Are their approaches different? High School Behavioral Science, 1977, 4, (2, Spring), 68-78.
- Stahl, R. J. The status of precollege psychology in Mississippi and Florida: A comparative report. Columbus, MS: School of Education, Mississippi University for Women, 1977, 41 pages. (ERIC Microfiche No. ED 142 499)
- Stahl, R. J. "Innovation or renovation? Lecture, commentary, and discussion in the precollege psychology classroom." Paper presented at the annual meeting of the American Psychological Association, Washington, D.C., September 3, 1976. (ERIC Microfiche No. ED 130 940).
- Stahl, R. J. The status of precollege psychology in Florida from 1970-71 through 1974-75: A report of a longitudinal study. Research Monograph No. 22. Gainesville, Florida: P.K. Yonge Laboratory School, 1976, 83 pages. (Submitted to ERIC).
- Stahl, R. J. Psychology in Florida secondary schools from 1972-73 through 1974-75: A comparative study. Trends in Social Education, 1978, 24, (2, Winter), 20-31.
- Stahl, R. J. & Casteel, J. D. Precollege psychology in Florida. High School Behavioral Science, 1975, 3, (1, Winter), 16-26.
- Stahl, R. J. & Hamami, F. "Some odds and ends relevant to precollege psychology in Florida: A collection of tidbits." Paper presented at the annual meeting of the Southeastern Psychological Association, Hollywood, Florida. May 4, 1974. (ERIC Microfiche No. ED 137 206).
- Stahl, R. J. The data base for the study of precollege psychology in Florida: 1970-71 and 1972-73. Gainesville, Florida: (unpublished manuscript), 1974, 155 pages. (ERIC Microfiche No. ED 096 209).
- Stahl, R. J. (Editor) High school psychology in the United States and Canada: An anthology of recent status reports. IDHR Research Monograph. Gainesville, Florida: Institute for Development of Human Resources, University of Florida, 1974. (ERIC Microfiche No. 096 208). 44 pages.
- Stahl, R. J. The need for standardized studies of high school psychology. Teaching of Psychology, 1976, 3, (3, October), 136-137.
- Stahl, R. J. & Casteel, J. D. A survey of the status of precollege psychology in Florida: 1970-71. In H. Fisher (Ed.), Developments in high school psychology. New York: Behavioral Publications, 1974, 95-112.
- Stahl, R. J. & Casteel, J. D. The status of precollege psychology in the state of Florida during 1970-71 and 1972-73: A comparative report. Research Monograph No. 8. Gainesville, Florida: P.K. Yonge Laboratory School, 1973. (ERIC Microfiche No. ED 087 651).
- Stahl, R. J. & Casteel, J. D. The 1970-71 study on the status of precollege psychology in the state of Florida: A final report. Resource Monograph No. 6. Gainesville, Florida: P.K. Yonge Laboratory School, 1972. (ERIC Microfiche No. ED 073 026).
- Stahl, R. J. & Casteel, J. D. High school psychology courses in Florida: A status study. Trends in Social Education, 1972, 18, (Winter), 1-2.